### SIGGRAPH2015 **Xroads** of **Discovery**

Variance Analysis for Monte Carlo Integration \*Adrien Pilleboue<sup>1</sup>, \*Gurprit Singh<sup>1</sup>, David Coeurjolly<sup>2</sup>, Michael Kazhdan<sup>3</sup>, Victor Ostromoukhov<sup>1,2</sup>

\*Joint first Authors, <sup>1</sup>Université Lyon 1, <sup>2</sup>CNRS/LIRIS UMR 5205, <sup>3</sup>Johns Hopkins University



## Monte Carlo Integration

f(x)

 $\int_{[0,1]^2} f(x) dx$ 





## Monte Carlo Integration



 $\int_{[0,1]^2} f(x) dx \approx \frac{1}{N} \sum_{i=1}^N f(x_i)$ 



## Light Simulation: on Surface





## Light Simulation: on Surface







### Light Simulation: Participating Media



## Regular Sampling Pattern

#### Euclidean



### Spherical

#### Hemispherical





# Purely Random Sampling PatternEuclideanSphericalHemispherical









## Jittered Sampling Pattern

### Euclidean



### Spherical Hemispherical





## Poisson Disk Sampling Pattern

### Euclidean



### Spherical Hemispherical





Ambient Occlusion

### Geometric Aliasing

Image Plane





Ambient Occlusion

### Geometric Aliasing

Image Plane



### Error: Structure Artifacts

#### Hemisphere

Same Hemispherical pointset at all hitpoints

Image Plane







### Error: Structures to Noise

#### No rotation



### With rotation



## Homogeneous Sampling Pattern





### Statistically invariant properties over the domain

### Homogeneous Sampling Pattern





## Homogeneous Sampling Pattern

Statistically invariant properties over the domain

Widesense stationary [Dippe and Wold 1985]





## Homogeneous Sampling Pattern

Statistically invariant properties over the domain

Widesense stationary [Dippe and Wold 1985]

All sampling patterns derived from white noise





### Regular Samples

Regular

#### Realisation 1

#### Realisation 2

#### Homogenization by Random Translation

#### Realisation 3

#### Homogenized

#### Multiple realisations



#### Homogenization by Random Translation



#### Realisation 1

#### Realisation 2

### Jittered Samples

#### **Realisation 3**

#### Homogenized

#### Multiple realisations



## Homogeneous Samples

## Homogenization by Random Rotation

#### Regular

#### Realisation 2

#### Realisation 1

#### **Realisation 3**

#### Homogenized

#### Multiple realisations



### Error in Terms of Variance

#### $Error = Bias^2 + Variance$



## Error in Terms of Variance

Bias

#### Homogeneous Sampling:

#### $Error = Bias^2 + Variance$

### Zero



### Error in Terms of Variance

#### Homogeneous Sampling:

### Bias

#### Implies:

#### $Error = Bias^2 + Variance$

### Zero

Error = Variance



## Nature of Noise

### Purely Random









#### Jittered

### MSE: 3.95x10<sup>-4</sup>



(96 hemispherical samples)

Regular

Image Plane

Regular



### Variance in Integration

2

Homogeneous Sampling Patterns



### Variance in Integration

2

Homogeneous Sampling Patterns

How can we characterize sampling patterns ?



## Previous Work on Fourier Analysis of Sampling Patterns

### Many prior works [Dippé and Wold 1985], [Cook 1986], [Ulichney 1987]





## Previous Work on Fourier Analysis of Sampling Patterns

Many prior works [Dippé and Wold 1985], [Cook 1986], [Ulichney 1987]

Error relates to the frequency content of samples, [Durand 2011]



## Previous Work on Fourier Analysis of Sampling Patterns

- Error relates to the frequency content of samples, [Durand 2011]
  - [Subr and Kautz 2013]

Many prior works [Dippé and Wold 1985], [Cook 1986], [Ulichney 1987]

Relates variance directly to the variance of Samples' Fourier Coefficients



## Regular Sampling Pattern

Samples





### Purely Random Sampling Pattern

#### Samples







### Poisson Disk Sampling Pattern

#### Samples





### Jittered Sampling Pattern

### Samples







## Radial Averging of Power Spectrum



2

Frequency

З




#### Variance in Integration

 $\mathbf{O}$ 

#### Homogeneous Samples + Frequency content (Power Spectra)



# $Var(\mathbf{I}_N) = \frac{\mu(\mathcal{T}^a)\mu(S^{a-1})}{N} \int_0^\infty \rho^{d-1} \breve{\mathcal{P}}_{\mathbf{S}}(\rho) \breve{\mathcal{P}}_{\mathbf{F}}(\rho) \mathsf{d}\rho$



# $Var(\mathbf{I}_N) = \frac{\mu(\mathcal{T}^d)\mu(S^{d-1})}{N} \int_0^\infty \rho^{d-1} \breve{\mathcal{P}}_{\mathbf{S}}(\rho) \breve{\mathcal{P}}_{\mathbf{F}}(\rho) \mathsf{d}\rho$



 $Var(\mathbf{I}_N) = \frac{\mu(\mathcal{T}^d)\mu(S^{d-1})}{N} \int_0^\infty \rho^{d-1} \breve{\mathcal{P}}_{\mathbf{S}}(\rho) \breve{\mathcal{P}}_{\mathbf{F}}(\rho) d\rho$ 



 $Var(\mathbf{I}_N) = \frac{\mu(\mathcal{T}^d)\mu(S^{d-1})}{N} \int_0^\infty \rho^{d-1} \mathcal{P}_{\mathbf{S}}(\rho) \mathcal{P}_{\mathbf{F}}(\rho) d\rho$ 



 $Var(I_N) = \frac{\mu(\mathcal{T}^d)\mu(S^{d-1})}{N} \int_0^\infty \rho^{d-1} \breve{\mathcal{P}}_{\mathbf{S}}(\rho) \breve{\mathcal{P}}_{\mathbf{F}}(\rho) \mathsf{d}\rho$ 



 $Var(I_N) = \frac{\mu(\mathcal{T}^d)\mu(S^{d-1})}{N} \int_0^\infty \rho^{d-1} \breve{\mathcal{P}}_{\mathbf{S}}(\rho) \breve{\mathcal{P}}_{\mathbf{F}}(\rho) d\rho$ 















# $Var(\mathbf{I}_N) = \frac{\mu(S^2)}{N} \sum_{l=1}^{\infty} (2l+1) \breve{\mathcal{P}}_{\mathbf{S}}(l) \breve{\mathcal{P}}_{\mathbf{F}}(l)$





# $Var(\mathbf{I}_N) = \frac{\mu(S^2)}{N} \sum_{l=1}^{\infty} (2l+1) \breve{\mathcal{P}}_{\mathbf{S}}(l) \breve{\mathcal{P}}_{\mathbf{F}}(l)$





































# Variance: Product of $\tilde{\mathcal{P}}_{s}(\cdot)$ and $\tilde{\mathcal{P}}_{F}(\cdot)$



## Variance: Product of $\mathcal{P}_{\mathbf{S}}(\cdot)$ and $\mathcal{P}_{\mathbf{F}}(\cdot)$

#### Euclidean

 $Var(I_N) \propto \frac{1}{N} \int_0^\infty \rho^{d-1} \breve{\mathcal{P}}_{\mathbf{S}}(\rho) \breve{\mathcal{P}}_{\mathbf{F}}(\rho) \mathsf{d}\rho$ 



# Variance: Product of $\tilde{\mathcal{P}}_{s}(\cdot)$ and $\tilde{\mathcal{P}}_{F}(\cdot)$

#### Euclidean

# $Var(I_N) \propto \frac{1}{N} \int_{0}^{\infty} \rho^{d-1} \breve{\mathcal{P}}_{\mathbf{S}}(\rho) \breve{\mathcal{P}}_{\mathbf{F}}(\rho) \mathsf{d} ho$

 $Var(I_N) \propto rac{1}{N} \sum_{l=1}^{\infty} (2l+1) ec{\mathcal{P}_S(l)} ec{\mathcal{P}_F(l)}$ Spherical





## Dependence on Number of Samples





## Dependence on Number of Samples



### Dependence on Number of Samples





# Euclidean



# Euclidean



# Euclidean Ps(p)





#### where, $c_F$ and $c'_F$ are constants

[Brandolini et al 2001, Mean square decay of Fourier transforms in euclidean and non euclidean spaces]

#### Integrand Power Spectrum





36

b = 0

 $\alpha \sqrt[d]{N}$ 

 $O\left(\frac{1}{N}\right)$ 

 $\widetilde{\mathcal{P}}_{\mathbf{S}}(\rho)$ 

 $Var(I_N)$ 

b = degree of the polynomial

d = dimensions

#### N = number of samples





 $\alpha \sqrt[d]{N}$ 

 $O\left(\frac{1}{N}\right)$ 

 $\mathcal{P}_{\mathbf{S}}(\rho)$ 

 $Var(I_N)$ 



 $\alpha \sqrt[d]{N}$ 

O



 $\frac{1}{\sqrt[d]{N^b}}$ d = dimensions N = num

N = number of samples





 $\alpha \sqrt[d]{N}$ 

 $O\left(\frac{1}{N}\right)$ 

 $\mathcal{P}_{\mathbf{S}}(\rho)$ 

 $Var(I_N)$ 



 $\alpha \sqrt[d]{N}$ 

O



#### $b \ge 1$

# $O\left(\frac{1}{N\sqrt[d]{N}}\right)$

 $\alpha \sqrt[d]{N}$ 

d = dimensions

#### N = number of samples





 $\alpha \sqrt[d]{N}$ 

 $O\left(\frac{1}{N}\right)$ 

 $\mathcal{P}_{\mathbf{S}}(\rho)$ 

 $Var(I_N)$ 



 $\alpha \sqrt[d]{N}$ 

O



#### $b \ge 1$



 $\alpha \sqrt[d]{N}$ 

d = dimensions

N = number of samples

O



 $b \to \infty$ 

 $\alpha \sqrt[d]{N}$ 









### Convergence Rate Analysis

#### Power Spectrum



#### Convergence rate



 $\langle N \sqrt{N} /$ 



### Convergence Rate Analysis

#### Power Spectrum



Convergence rate



### Convergence Rate Analysis







### Jittered vs Poisson Disk Sampling






# Why is jittered sampling better than Poisson Disk sampling ?



### Poisson Disk



## Power Spectra

### Jittered





## Poisson Disk $O\left(\frac{1}{N}\right)$



### Constant Offset

## Power Spectra: Low Frequency Region

## Jittered $O\left(\frac{1}{N\sqrt{N}}\right)$







## CCVT [Balzer et al. 2009]

Variance Convergence Rate: 0







## CCVT [Balzer et al. 2009]





Our mathematical model can be used to tailor new sampling patterns.



## Novel Contributions

### Frequency analysis of spherical and hemispherical samples using spherical harmonics



## Novel Contributions

using spherical harmonics to design new sampling patterns

### Frequency analysis of spherical and hemispherical samples

### Unified closed form variance expression that can be used



## Novel Contributions

Frequency analysis of spherical and hemispherical samples using spherical harmonics
Unified closed form variance expression that can be used to design new sampling patterns
Analysis tool to theoretically compute and bound variance convergence rates of any stochastic sampler



### Extend our mathematical framework to adaptive sampling strategies

## Future Work



## Future Work

strategies

deterministic sampling patterns

### Extend our mathematical framework to adaptive sampling

### Explore how we can extend our mathematical model to



Extend our mathematical framework to adaptive sampling strategies

Explore how we can extend our mathematical model to deterministic sampling patterns

Use our framework to construct new sampling patterns with the best convergence speed and with lowest variance even for small number of samples

## Future Work



### Our tools will be made public very soon.



### http://liris.cnrs.fr/variance



ANR excellence chair (ANR-10-CEXC-002-01)

DigitalSnow/DigitalFoam programs(ANR-11-BS02-009 and PALSE/2013/21)

## Acknowledgements

- David Kazhdan
- Kartic Subr
- Mathieu Desbrun and Katherine Breeden
- Jonathan Dupuy and Nicolas Bonneel
- Jean-Claude lehl, Vincent Nivoliers and Brian Wyvill
- Anonymous reviewers



Thank you for your attention.

 $Var(I_N) \propto \frac{1}{N} \int_0^\infty \rho^{d-1} \breve{\mathcal{P}}_{\mathbf{S}}(\rho) \breve{\mathcal{P}}_{\mathbf{F}}(\rho) \mathsf{d}\rho$  $Var(I_N) \propto \frac{1}{N} \sum_{l=1}^{\infty} (2l+1) \breve{\mathcal{P}}_{\mathbf{S}}(l) \breve{\mathcal{P}}_{\mathbf{F}}(l)$ 

Power spectra behavior at low frequencies matters !

Thank you for your attention.

 $Var(I_N) \propto \frac{1}{N} \int_0^\infty \rho^{d-1} \breve{\mathcal{P}}_{\mathbf{S}}(\rho) \breve{\mathcal{P}}_{\mathbf{F}}(\rho) \mathsf{d}\rho$  $Var(I_N) \propto \frac{1}{N} \sum_{l=1}^{\infty} (2l+1) \breve{\mathcal{P}}_{\mathbf{S}}(l) \breve{\mathcal{P}}_{\mathbf{F}}(l)$ 

Power spectra behavior at low frequencies matters !





## Convergence Rate Analysis









## Light Simulation: on Surface







## Light Simulation: on Surface







Sphere

### Light Source

## Light Simulation: Participating media







### Structural Artifacts

### Ambient Occlusion



### Image Plane





## Ambient Occlusion

### Structural Artifacts



### Image Plane



### Euclidean 2D



### Spherical





## Regular samples

Structural Artifacts

Image Plane





## Jittered Sampling Pattern

### Samples

### Power Spectrum

0





C

ower

## Radial averging of Power Spectrum

2

Frequency





З





### For a given number of samples

## Dependence on Number of Samples



## Dependence on Number of Samples



### For a given number of samples

### Increase in number of samples





## Dependence on Number of Samples





## Dependence on Number of Samples

### **Integrand Power Spectrum**

**Scaled Power Spectrum** 

Frequency

### Increase in number of samples









![](_page_106_Picture_1.jpeg)

![](_page_107_Figure_0.jpeg)

![](_page_107_Picture_1.jpeg)


# Low Frequency zone

Integrand Power Spectrum

Shifted Power Spectrum

Frequency

### Increase in number of samples



# Regular Sampling Pattern

00

Samples

## Power Spectrum

0	0	0	0			0	0
ଚ୍ଚ	ଚ	ଡ	<mark>с</mark> о	<mark>с</mark> о	<mark>с</mark> о	<mark>с</mark> о	ଡ଼
O	0	0	O	O	O	O	O
0	0	0	0	0	Ο	0	Ο
0	0	0	Ο	Ο	0	Ο	0
Ο	•	0	0	0	0	0	0
0	0	0	O	Ο	Ο	0	0
0	•	•	0	0	0	0	0



# Paris Chapter SIGGRAPH2015 **Xroads of Discovery**

Variance Analysis for Monte Carlo Integration \*Adrien Pilleboue<sup>1</sup>, \*Gurprit Singh<sup>1</sup>, David Coeurjolly<sup>2</sup>, Michael Kazhdan<sup>3</sup>, Victor Ostromoukhov<sup>1,2</sup>

\*Joint first Authors, <sup>1</sup>Université Lyon 1, <sup>2</sup>CNRS/LIRIS UMR 5205, <sup>3</sup>Johns Hopkins University





# Previous Work



## Previous Work

### Durand [2011] A Frequency analysis of Monte-Carlo and other numerical integration schemes

# Error relates to the frequency content of samples



## Previous Work

### Durand [2011] A Frequency analysis of Monte-Carlo and other numerical integration schemes

## Subr and Kautz [2013] Fourier analysis of stochastic sampling strategies

for assessing bias and variance in integration

# Error relates to the frequency content of samples

Relates variance directly to the variance of Samples' Fourier Coefficients



# Integrand Power Spectrum



Brandolini et al. [2001] Mean square decay of Fourier transforms in euclidean and non euclidean spaces.

### where, $c_F$ and $c'_F$ are constants



# Convergence Rate Analysis





 $O\left(\frac{1}{N\sqrt{N}}\right)$ 

 $O\left(\frac{1}{N}\right)$ 



## Power Spectrum Bounds

## Poisson Disk





## Power Spectrum Bounds

## Poisson Disk





## With Bounds

